

**MINUTES OF THE JUDICIAL PERFORMANCE EVALUATION COMMISSION (JPEC)  
March 28, 2008**

**Commission Members**

**Present**

Mr. Felix Briones, Jr.  
Ms. Barbara Castillo-Velarde  
Mr. Avilio Chavez  
Ms. Phyllis Dominguez  
Ms. Francesca Martinez Estevez  
Justice Gene E. Franchini  
Mr. Joe Gant  
Mr. Eluid Martinez  
Ms. Josephine Mitchell  
Mr. Regis Pecos  
Ms. Leonila Duran Serna

**Absent**

Ms. Richard Alvidrez  
Ms. Lori Hartley  
Ms. D. Joy Fresquez Mynatt  
Ms. Ruth Schifani

**Agenda**

- The Agenda was approved by the JPEC.

**Minutes of February 29, 2008**

- The minutes of the February 29, 2008 meeting were approved on the motion of Joe Gant and seconded by Josephine Mitchell.

**Announcements**

- Information was given to JPEC on Colorado's merit selection system. Louise reported that a written description of the proposed evaluation, in particular to measure the effectiveness of JPE programs will be prepared by Jordon Singer, Director of Research, Institute for the Advancement of the American Legal System, and Professor David Brody from Washington State University for the JPEC's review. Also, New Mexico prepared a short paragraph for the Institute's annual report that explains why JPE is important to New Mexico constituents. Also, comments were given on the impact of the Institute's report and work in the area of JPE programs. The Institute will hold a JPE conference on August 5 and 6 in Denver. Approximately 100 people will be invited, with the expectation that probably 60-70 will attend. Each working group participant will be asked to designate up to four others for his or her state to attend the conference. Potential guests who are not associated with a working group member will be invited individually.
- Felix, Josephine and Brian Sanderoff will present systemic issues at the Judicial Conclave scheduled for June 11, 2008. A telephone conference is scheduled for 4/17/08 to prepare this list. From the telephone conference, Louise will email the list to JPEC for feedback and comments.
- Letters of appreciation were mailed to key legislators and the Governor for their

support of JPEC's non-reverting fund.

### **2008 District Court Judges' Final Evaluations**

- Members received a list of the interview leaders for 4/25/08 in Santa Fe, Judicial Information Division. A map and directions will be included in the meeting materials.
- The draft narratives for the judges in the 2<sup>nd</sup> District are due to Louise on or before 4/9/08.
- JPEC approved the biographical changes for Judges Gary Clingman and Mathew Reynolds.
- The JPEC reviewed and discussed edits to the narratives and/or recommendations for the following judges:
  - √ 11<sup>th</sup> District - Judge Robert Aragon;
  - √ 13<sup>th</sup> District - Judges George Eichwald, Louis McDonald and John F. Davis
  - √ 2<sup>nd</sup> District - Judges Ted Baca, Theresa Baca, Clay Campbell, Neil Candelaria, Angela Jewell, Monica Zamora, Carl Butkus, Valerie Mackie Huling, Kenneth Martinez, Albert (Pat) Murdoch, Nan Nash, and Geraldine Rivera.
- Judges J. Michael Kavanaugh, Richard Knowles, William McBee and Frank Wilson will not stand for retention.
- The JPEC conducted interviews in Albuquerque with Judges Ernesto Romero, John Romero, Ross Sanchez, Denise Barela Shepherd, Linda Vanzi, Deborah Davis Walker, William Lang, and Stan Whitaker.

### **2008 Appellate Court Judges' Evaluations**

- Brian Sanderoff presented information regarding response rates for judicial performance surveys. The document provides a more in-depth explanation of the response rates and the effects of the responses rates on the generalization of the judicial performance data. After discussing, Josephine Mitchell MOVED that JPEC have the response rate information on-hand and make available to those judges when asked. Avilio Chavez SECONDED the motion and it PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.
- Brian Sanderoff and Brad Morrison, Research & Polling, Inc., presented the 2008 results for the appellate judges – Justice Patricio Serna and Richard Bosson, and Judges Roderick Kenney, Ira Robinson, Jonathan Sutin, and Michael Vigil. Response rates across the board went up, for the exception of lawyers.
- The appellate interviews are scheduled for May 30, 2008 and June 27, 2008.

### **Next Scheduled Meeting**

We have scheduled the next meeting for April 25, 2008, Judicial Information Division, 2905 Rodeo Park Drive East, Bldg. 5, Santa Fe.

Minutes prepared by:

---

Louise Baca-Sena, AOC Staff